

Education Outcome Area Working Group Meeting Transcript

Tuesday, February 14, 2023

So, good afternoon everyone and welcome to the first outcome area working group meeting for education. We're all happy to have you all here today. We have a few housekeeping items to go over just before we get started, so if we can go to the next slide please. So, this is we're working on one piece of this, but we do have ASL interpreters who will be joining us. So, if that is a service that you need, those will be in the side by side speaker view. We do also have close captioning if you need to enable that. And then in chat, we do invite everyone to introduce yourselves. Tell us what organization you are with. If you feel comfortable saying where you're from, it just helps us kind of get an idea of who's here today, and who's joining us and participating in this process. We also ask that when we get to the public discussion period of this, that you raise your hands and you can use your zoom hand to do that. And that just kind of helps us moderate and see who's raised their hand in what order, so that when we're calling on folks, we are tracking against that. So, one of the things that we want to kind of set the stage for today is as we're moving through this meeting, we've got a couple of questions that we'll be revisiting what is digital equity, and why is it important? And so, I would just encourage you all that will be touching on it throughout the entire meeting. Share your thoughts in the chat as we go through on what that means to you, and why you think that it's important. All right, so we can go to the next slide, please? And speakers and presenters, if you can, just let Mel know to go to the next slide. That would be great. So briefly, today we will have just an overview of the digital equity planning process. Some of you are familiar with it, some of you will be new for it. We also have some presenters and speakers here today. Hi, Jess! We have speakers and presenters here today from the NTIA. That's the National Telecommunications and Information Administration. We have a guest speaker from UC and CITRIS. And we also have a guest speaker, a senior fellow from the National Skills Coalition. One of the cornerstones of this meeting and these meetings going forward is communicating with members of public and folks that have lived experiences and so that's going to be a big piece of this today as well. So, we'll have an opportunity to engage and talk with one another, and we will be wrapping up with some calls to actions and in activities that can be taken, and then what the next steps will be. So, I would like to hand it over to Scott Adams, Deputy Director for the California Department of Technology, and he's going to start the overview of the digital equity planning process. Thank you, Laura, and welcome everybody. It's a privilege and an honor to be here today in a community of partnership all aligned around digital equity here in the State of California. As Laura mentioned, this is our kickoff of the Education Outcome Area Working Group, which is part of the state's digital equity planning process. And so, I was gonna just give a real quick overview of where the digital equity planning process and the digital equity plan fits into the context of broadband for all, which is really the state's overarching, you know, program and related initiatives to close the digital divide in the state. Next slide, please. So, as I mentioned broadband for all is the State's commitment to bridge the digital divide and foster digital equity throughout the State, and Broadband For All is focused on addressing some of the key barriers to digital equity which are access, affordability, adoption, and really empowering digital literacy and inclusion. Next slide. This link here is really just to kind of center where we are in the evolution of Broadband For All. You know, the state's have been largely aligned at the Broadband Council level since 2010 and that's a multi-state agency body with nine state agencies, the California Emerging Technology Fund, and representatives of the State Senate and Assembly. And their work has been to coordinate broadband deployment and adoption efforts in the state and on unserved communities as determined by the Public Utilities Commission. Into 2020,

Governor News issued his broadband executive order, which really directed the broadband council to you know, refocus their efforts or redouble their efforts and create a statewide broadband action plan, which was done in just 4 months during the pandemic in collaboration with over 700 entities, and really create a path forward on how the state would close its digital divide. Another key development was in 2021, the legislature and the Governor really answered the call with the historic passage of Senate Bill 156, which created a structure and framework to address a lot of the access and infrastructure needs allocating 6 billion dollars...3.2 billion of that going to the Department of Technology to really design and develop a statewide open access middle-mile network to allow for a variety of entities to provide last mile service in on unserved communities throughout the State. And so, that effort is a collaborative effort between the Department of Technology Golden State Network, who is the third-party administrator and CalTrans which is really building that network along the state highway system. Also important with Senate Bill 156 is that that allocated another 2+ billion dollars to the California Public Utilities Commission to administer a series of last mile grant programs, a technical assistance program, a Federal Funding Account and Loan Loss Reserve to provide available grants to ISPs and other entities to develop last mile network solutions. You'll see on the graph that in 2022, the investment infrastructure and jobs that included a number of broadband programs that allocated over 65 billion dollars in funding to States and local entities to close the digital divide in their areas. What we're going to focus on today is the Department of Technology's focus, which really was directed by Assembly Bill 2750, which was passed by the Legislature signed by the Governor at the end of last year to seek Federal funding to develop a digital equity plan throughout the State. Next slide, please. So, the planning process that we are following over the next several months to create the state's Digital Equity Plan has five components. The first is a statewide planning group, which is a body that was established of Broadband Council member entities and other state agencies to advise the Department of Technology on the development of the Digital Equity Plan. The second component is outcome area working groups, which we are here at the inaugural working group that will help identify...um, actually, I'll go over the responsibilities in the next step. The third component is a series of digital equity surveys to gather information...critical information and data from organizations and individuals throughout the State. The fourth component is we intend to host 20 regional and local outreach events throughout the state to engage with community partners and residents where they to get shared and linked to experiences about what the state should consider inclusion in the digital equity plan and then ongoing public engagement. Next slide, please. So, the six Outcome Area Working Groups, the kind of plays...where this working group is...are...to really connect to, um...you know, policy areas that are important to the State. So, the first one is Education, the second one is Health, the third Digital Literacy and Inclusion. The fourth Essential Services Accessibility and Civic Engagement. The fifth is Workforce and Economic Development, and then the sixth is Tribal Collaboration. Next slide, please. Really want to center our focus here in this meeting and in subsequent meetings, that as we develop the state's digital equity plan in partnership with you all, that the Digital Equity Act really directs state's prioritize investments for eight covered populations, and those are individuals living in covered households, aging individuals, incarcerated individuals, veterans, individuals with disabilities, those with language barriers, members of racial and ethnic minority groups, and individuals who reside in rural areas. Next slide, please. So, our objective here collectively is, we work over the coming months to utilize this working group space to convene subject matter experts and practitioners to develop strategies that align with the digital equity plan priorities, and really look through the lens of those eight covered populations. Our objectives over the next many months will be to collectively develop a statewide stakeholder map for this particular outcome area to conduct an asset

inventory of programs, plans, and services for this outcome area. We will really enroll your support and issue a call to action to promote and encourage participation in this statewide digital equity survey, conduct a gap analysis for each outcome area, and then develop recommendations ultimately for CDT to consider for inclusion in the State Digital Equity Plan. Next slide. And I guess that concludes my presentation. I just want to thank you all and really look forward to this session. Laura, back to you. Thank you, Scott. Okay. So, we're going to move on to our next section talking about what is digital equity and why is it important. And this is an area where I would encourage you as we said at the beginning to add to the chat what it means to you and as we do that we'll monitor the chat. We will keep an eye on that. We really want to hear from you, and as you're doing that, we're also going to hear from, you know as I already mentioned Gladys, Camille and Amanda, and they're going to be addressing those same questions so if we can go to the next slide, we'll just cover a couple of things before I turn it over to them. So, what is the baseline definition of digital equity that we're starting from? It's a question that we get a lot. And so, this is our guidance, and where we're starting from. But we very much want to hear from you. We want to know what it means to you and to your communities so digital equity, and this is from NTIA. It is the condition in which individual communities have the information technology capacity that is needed for full participation in the society and economy of the United States. So that's where we're starting from, and that's where we're building from. So next slide, please. All right. So, these are once again the prompts for the chat, and also the questions that Gladys Palpallatoc from NTIA, Camille Crittenden from UC CITRIS, UC...sorry and CITRIS and Amanda Bergson-Shilcock from the National Skills Coalition will be addressing today. So, I'm going to turn it over first to Gladys. And Gladys from the NTIA and federal perspective, what does digital equity mean? And why is it important? Why is it important? Thanks so much Laura and Scott. Good afternoon, everybody. My name is Gladys Palpallatoc, and I am one of two Federal program officers or State leads for California from the NTIA, the National Telecommunications and Information Administration. Thank you to the CDT team for inviting us to participate today, and great to see so many long time partners here. I took a look at the chat and the participant list. My focus today is, as Laura and Scott have already said, is to share the definition of D.E.— digital equity, objectives of the planning process, and how it will factor into the state capacity grant. For the Digital Equity Act programs, digital equity is defined as the condition for, and this is a little repetitive to what I just read, is defined as the condition in which individuals and communities have the information technology capacity that is needed to really fully participate in society and the economy today. Without it, that's really a disadvantage to already disadvantaged communities. Digital inclusion enables or leads to digital equity. Digital inclusion to us means activities that means the activities that are necessary to ensure that all individuals have access to, and the use of affordable information and communication technologies such as reliable, fixed, and wireless broadband Internet service, internet enabled devices that meet the needs of the user, and applications and online content designed to enable and encourage self-sufficiency, participation and collaboration. It must also include obtaining access to digital literacy training, the provision of quality, technical support, and obtaining basic awareness of measures to ensure online privacy and cyber security. Digital equity is the goal. And digital inclusion is how we get there. As Scott already mentioned, CDT was awarded the 4 million dollar state planning grant for one year, beginning 2022 till November 2023. The planning process objective is to develop a state digital equity plan. The planning process requires engagement of major key stakeholders and the public throughout the State to solicit input and feedback from communities and sectors like yours to develop the State digital equity plan. As part of the bipartisan infrastructure law, the Digital Equity Act and BEAD (Broadband Equity, Access and Deployment) program goal is connecting 100% of all

Americans. So, local and regional participation is a must and all voices need to be heard in order for us to be successful. The State will need the help of each working group to reach and engage your networks deeply throughout the State. The planning process will factor into the next phase, the state capacity grant. Only entities who complete the planning grant program can apply, and a state digital equity plan is required to be eligible. The state capacity grant will be used to implement the state digital equity plans and promote digital inclusion. NTIA anticipates a NOFO or a Notice Of Funding Opportunity for the state capacity grants by the end of this year. By mid-2024, we anticipate that the 5-year state capacity implementation will have begun. That concludes my piece of the presentations. Thank you again, and happy to take any questions if we have time for it. Back to you, Laura. Thank you, Gladys, and also I want to say thank you to everybody for the continued discussion in chat. I'm watching it as it's going through. Please keep it up. This is fantastic. So, we're next going to turn it over to Camille Crittenden to talk about what it means in education, both higher-Ed and more broadly in education in general. Camille? Yeah, thank you, Laura. It's really great to be here, and I love all the active discussion. What I would hope to contribute just in the next few minutes is a little bit of perspective on the need for high speed broadband, as we all can agree on, I think, throughout all the levels of education, but to focus perhaps a little bit on higher-Ed. I. My role is at University of California. I work at CITRIS, which is the Center for IT Research in the Interest of Society. It's a multi-campus research institute that is headquartered at UC Berkeley, but we have partnerships at UC Davis, Merced and Santa Cruz as well. So, I worked with the UC CIO to actually pull together a working group related to how we can leverage UC infrastructure to expand access to broadband services throughout the state. So, I'll put a link to that report in the chat when I'm done with my comments. But I would like to just speak perhaps a little bit more broadly about broadband and education. Of course, we all agree that broadband is necessary for student success. So, not only the student in the classroom, but at home or in the community. I think someone mentioned, you know, digital equity is not having to see students sit in the fast food parking lot in order to do their homework. So, I think that is really one marker of digital equity. So, I have three 'A' words in addition to the ones that Scott presented in his slide. So, is broadband available? And I think these mapping exercises are helpful as flawed as they might be hopefully, we can improve on them. But to really understand where broadband is available and where it's not, and to remedy that, if needed. Is it adequate? So, it's not just a yes or no question. But do students and other community members have access to it at sufficient speed to be able to fully participate and say zoom classes, or to take in video content that might be necessary for their learning. And ideally also is their device adequate that they wouldn't have to be doing their homework, say on a smartphone, but would have a computer available that they could do that on. And finally, is it affordable? And I think we'll get into this probably more later. But how can we help to expand the adoption of the affordable connectivity program to make sure that all of those eligible households really know about it, and are taking advantage of it. So, those are some of the overarching considerations, but thinking about specifically high speed broadband, it's really necessary for universities and the students and faculty that we serve not only at that individual kind of retail level for them to have access to high speed broadband, but also think about university research and the necessity of high-speed broadband to really move ahead the cutting edge discoveries that have kept California at the forefront of the country through our excellent public, higher at institutions. So, if you think about emerging fields like Ag Tech, you really need broadband in order to do some of the analysis, data, analysis, image collection, robotics, and things that might be associated with the next generation agriculture technologies. Think about research computing, like all the discoveries and genetics and drug discovery, anything that requires large amounts of data to be transmitted over a

network. I know CENIC does this well, and it's partnered well with the UCs to make sure that that capacity is there. But we'd love to see that extended, the opportunities for high-performance computing to the other higher-Ed institutions as well. Think about the emerging field of data science. That's not just what happens on your desktop or your laptop, but how are we sharing data across investigators or across research teams. We're going to need high-speed broadband to accommodate the huge amounts of data, especially imaging that might be associated with things like healthcare. I wanted to mention also that for universities just as institutions, and if you think about UC as well as CSU...I see Kendra is on the line I'd love for her to chime in if opportunity allows, but...and also of course, the whole system of community colleges. These are huge institutions, and even just operationally, a lot of the business is moving to the cloud. So, we need to have really reliable high speed broadband for the operations of the University to go on and to be efficient and effective. Thinking now about the role of higher-Ed institutions, especially again public—I'm really proud to work at you know, a high level public institution, I think we all can be committed to that mission...can help with disseminating information, so helping through our hundreds of thousands of students through our many staff and faculty members, how can we help to make sure that people know about the activities of the Broadband Council and this planning process we would love to help distribute the survey to make sure that that gets out to as many people as possible and to really draw on the resources of the University not only the physical infrastructure which I think we could do more there as well through our field stations, the agricultural natural resources stations and such to reach all 58 counties of California, but also through our students to draw on them to help serve their communities as digital navigators, and I was thinking not only for helping people to get familiar with the devices themselves, but also to publicize and help people say, sign up for the affordable connectivity program. Are there other ways that we can use students as communication vehicles to reach into some of those populations that we would like to reach. At Cal-UC and I know this is true also at CSU and the community colleges, perhaps even more. We really serve diverse populations. So, at you see, about a third of our students are the first in their families to go to college. Many of them speak multiple languages, or perhaps English is not their first language at home. There's a range of socioeconomic levels represented, I think, about a third of the UC students are Pell Grant eligible, and I'm sure that number is probably more at CSU and at the community colleges as well. So, I think, when we talk about digital equity, this is a really great place to do that work that we're gonna be able to reach out to a lot of the eligible populations. I want to mention also a couple of related institutions, and that's at UC, we have 5 health centers. So, if you think about the need for broadband in healthcare delivery and healthcare research that those places are going to be really important. I know that health is a separate working group, but I wanted to mention that also in the context of higher education because that's a key piece where I think that we can also make a contribution. I wanted to mention to the training and innovation and entrepreneurship. This might not be so obvious, but if you have students who are interested in creating their own startups and creating new businesses and commercializing maybe research that they've done at the University, a lot of that is also going to need to have the best broadband available, and that ultimately is going to contribute to the economy of California. So, I think we can make a make an argument there for also bolstering broadband access for those students who are working on entrepreneurial programs. So, I'll sum up and just say that I'm excited to be a representative from UC on this group. I would love to see how we can leverage the enormous UC system to implement and accelerate the access affordability, and, you know adequate speeds for broadband to Our students and to all of the communities that they live within. You see, and others have, you know, miles of facilities and property. For the physical infrastructure, we'd love to see how we can better leverage that, as well as

the students that we have, and their families and other outreach and community service kind of programs. One question that I'll just leave with that that I'd love to see further discussion is about how do we measure success? How do we know that we've had an impact through these programs? So, that's a...that's a tough question. But I would love to engage with that one as well. So, back to you, Laura. Thank you, Camille, and feel free in the chat to respond to that question, how do we measure it? Because again we would love to hear from all of you. So, I'm now going to hand it over to Amanda, and we're going to take another approach in looking at this from what do the skills required for closing the digital divide look like? So, Amanda I'm going to hand it over to you. Thanks so much, Laura. And thanks to Scott and the team for the opportunity to be with all of you today. I work for the nonprofit, nonpartisan National Skills Coalition. We are a big tent coalition of workforce and education advocates. And I'm going to be sharing some resources with you today that come from a study that we recently did to better understand the demand for digital skills in the job market specifically. We know that there's a lot of reasons people need digital skills, and that certainly includes participating in adult education, higher education, K-12 education, civic society, but we really focus in particular on the workforce. So next slide, please. So, what I'm gonna run through today is some top line findings from our research on the demand for digital skills. There's full details in our full report which is linked in the slides, and I know you'll all have access to these slides after today's conversation. Next slide. So, I wanted to emphasize first, that the digital divide is not just about broadband. It is absolutely also about skills, and that is crucially important...next slide...as we think about closing digital equity gaps. The study that I'm about to share with you, we analyzed 43 million help wanted ads from the year 2021 that were posted by employers. Across those ads, each sought workers with an array of different skills and average debate skills. Next slide. We coded those skills according to whether they were definitely, likely, or not digital. And for example, definitely digital skills were those that were things like Microsoft Excel or a programming language. And likely digital skills were things like bookkeeping where you could do them on pen and paper. But most often these days people do them using a computer program. Next slide. So, how does California stack up? California employers are more likely than the national average to require definitely digital skills. You can see that over half of all job ads in the State require definitely digital skill and 91% require are likely digital skill. Next slide. So, what do we mean when we talk about digital skills? Well, we know that education partners have a huge role in helping people build both foundational and industry specific skills. And I'll talk more about what those are in just a moment. That includes adult schools, career technical education programs, colleges, and of course K-12. Next slide. So, I want to share some examples of how digital skills exist in the real world, right? You can see here an example from the creative field of audio editing. Next slide. You can see also pre-pandemic, a lot of medical office receptionist and administrative staff have responsibility for checking patients in for in-person visits. Now they often have responsibility for troubleshooting, tele-health services, and helping patients who may be senior citizens or people with disabilities to navigate the online telehealth portal. Next slide. Amanda Bergson-Shilcock: When we think about digital skills, we don't always think about firefighters, but the US Department of the Interior indicated that while then firefighters increasingly need digital skills. Next slide. Ag is another area of precision. Agriculture needs greenhouse workers who can interpret sensors. Folks who are out in the field using a John Deere tractor or combine harvester need to be able to understand and use the onboard technology in those pieces of very expensive machinery. Next slide. Digital skills also include folks in the energy, industry, utility workers, and others who keep our electricity and our broadband on and working. Next slide. So, that's a very quick tour through some of the kinds of digital skills that we saw in demand from employers. The take home message of this slide is that

employers want people to have digital skills, even if they're hiring for a job that only requires 0 - 2 years of experience, and in the next slide, you'll see that employers want to have digital skills even for positions that require a high school diploma or an associate degree. So, this is really bringing home the message that digital equity means helping everyone in every level build digital skills, particularly because we hear over and over again that a major reason that people enroll in education is because they want to get a job or get a better job. Next slide. So, we also want to be careful not to make assumptions about people's age and their digital skills, right? Sometimes folks assume oh, this is a problem that the retirement calendar will solve. Older workers will retire, and younger workers are all digital natives. Well, first of all, that's unfair to older workers, many of whom are very comfortable and fluent with technology. But second of all, that overlooks the fact that a lot of younger workers have fragmented knowledge. That means they're comfortable with some digital skills, but not comfortable with others. So, maybe they're great at sending text messages or making a Tik Tok video, but does not feel comfortable using electronic health record software. And so, the trick for digital equity is to really think about how do we help people build bridges from the skills they have to the skills they need, and really focus with an asset based lens instead of a deficit based lens that suggests that folks are somehow lacking. Next slide. So, folks need both foundational and industry specific skills. What do I mean by foundational? Well foundational skills are things like able to download and install a mobile app on your phone, comfortable logging into a website if it requires two-factor authentication, able to use basic office software but almost everyone also needs industry specific skills. Next slide. So, let's talk about what that looks like. Oh, sorry. Okay, great. The next slide I have for you then, is the economic impact. So, it's a little bit hard to see. Sorry about that, but on the left hand side we have jobs that require no digital skills, have a median hourly wage of \$17.62 an hour, whereas a job that requires even one definitely digital skill is a 23% increase in the median hourly wage. That is a difference that anybody would notice in their paycheck. And we see that as jobs require more digital skills, that salary continues to go up. So, there's a real economic impact. Next slide. And of course, as people earn more, they also contribute more in taxes. Next slide. So, that's the kind of take home. And when we look more specifically from the national data to the California data, we see an affirmation that businesses are really interested in folks with the that strong, basic foundational skills, next slide, as well as these industry specific skills, right? And I just put a couple on top here. I was amazed when we went through the data how many folks were looking for robotics skills not just in manufacturing, but in the retail sector and others...dental practice management software way higher on the list than I would have predicted, right? So, there's a lot of things that can be embedded in job training programs, community college and create technical education classes, but it's also important to think about that first step in the community. Worker centers, good will or nonprofit community based organizations, faith-based organizations, libraries...the kind of entry level skills that they're teaching also need to provide on-ramp to these greater industry-specific skills. Next slide. So, now that we have the sort of context on the research findings. I want to just emphasize in my last couple of minutes here how these findings can help inform the State digital equity planning process. Next slide. In particular, we've already heard quite a bit today about the importance of investing in broadband and digital devices as part of the Federal funding, but it's also incredibly important to invest in digital skills training. Next slide. In addition, we want to make sure that every state, and particularly California's digital Equity Plan, takes full advantage of the fact that the Federal government is very clear that digital equity funds can be used to invest in basic applied and advanced digital skills training, so it can cover those kind of foundational entry level classes as well as the more sophisticated ones. Next slide. We also want to encourage California to invest in industry sector

partnerships like the highroad training partnerships, the state is already operating that bring employers together with education and training providers. Next slide. We encourage the use of census data to supplement these findings to identify areas where there might be gaps, particularly for Digital Equity Act covered populations, happy to chat more about that in the Q&A if folks have questions. Next slide. And of course, the support of services like childcare and transportation that make it possible for people to be able to participate in education opportunities. Next slide. So, that's the end of our presentation, and I've included a couple of follow on slides here. You've got my contact information. You've got a link to our full report, and again, you will be getting these slides. After today's event, they will be publicly available. But thank you all so much for the opportunity to chat with you and let me turn things back over to Laura. Thank you, Amanda. And also thank you, everybody, for continuing the discussion in the chat. It's great to see what you're talking about, and following along with that. So, what we're going to do right now is we're going to take kind of a different...a pivot and moving toward what we're calling the community and lived experiences discussion, and this is truly intended to be a discussion. So, when we are talking about what lived experiences are, what we're looking for and we talked about the eight covered populations earlier in the presentation today, is we're looking for experiences from historically disconnected communities, community members, individuals, if you either are one, you work with these populations and are familiar with these stories, if you can share them with us so that we can continue to gain a better understanding of the experiences, and you need barriers to accessing the digital world that are being experienced. Again, we're looking at this from the education perspective, but we're also looking very much at those eight covered populations that we talked about earlier, so this is where we're going to open things up to actual verbal discussion if you want to, you know, unmute yourselves, or turn your camera on to talk, I would ask if you raise your hand so that we can kind of identify and call on people to share some of the experiences that you've either had yourself with digital barriers or sorry, barriers to digital equity as we've kind of talked about what digital equity means here today, or if you have worked with groups, organizations, populations that have experience that, we would really like to hear from you, what you are seeing, and what you are experiencing. So, if we want to go to the next slide. The first question that we really want to ask is, what are the barriers to digital equity that you or your community members face and how might those barriers affect educational outcomes? I think that there's been a lot of that conversation in the chat kind of going back and forth. I would ask...hi, Phil! Good to see you. If we can spotlight Phil. Phil Neufeld if you'd like to just introduce yourself. Sure. Phil Neufeld. I'm with Fresno unified school district and part of the Fresno Coalition for Digital Inclusion. And Laura good to see you. I've been co-leading a personalized learning program over the last since 2016. And some...it's just a...there are things like Khan Academy...I mean one of my daughters were ninth grade, and I got to just say girls and STEM...they completed their college math before high school is done, but in ninth grade I'm like I can't help you really well around this stuff. Let me turn you to Khan Academy. Great resource. And there's lots of resources like that. What I found was that our teachers were basically having to make...as we shift it to digital in our district in intentional, meaningful ways, they would basically go...hmm, I can't actually do that because when these kids go home they don't have access to Internet across their daily journey in their homes. They just don't have access. So, you'd basically have either...less rigorous, less ready future, ready instruction that was equally delivered in the classroom. But then when the students who have privilege would go home, they could actually get the rest of the kind of instruction they needed or you'd have differentiated instruction that basically reinforces the inequity. So, I would say, the first barrier, and is the amount of students who are unserved...and Scott, who's...who has heard me say this often, the FCC maps were highly inaccurate. They are way more unserved in the city of Fresno. Our

data would suggest 8 million measurements of Internet access, that we may be in around 136,000 residents out of 500,000. And so, I think that's the first piece. Good cell service and good wire line broadband into homes is a key. But if you don't have that community centers, churches, public spaces, whatever you can do to create that first level of access. The second is digital literacy, and students picked it up fairly quickly. But we've got to have some places where they can get the support around that. Give you one more example of that inequity that exists. When you don't have that, the notion that people have connectivity at home, we start again to differentiate in ways that reinforce the inequity. The tutoring solutions that we sometimes are using now are telephony. They're not face to face. They're not rich because these students are connected, and so we accept that. And we now again put subpar services to students in poverty and in Fresno, it's also mostly students of color who are getting that impact. So, to give you some sense, Laura, about the challenge. Very much so, thank you, Phil. And really appreciate you sharing. And hopefully this continues to kind of spark the conversation. Augustine. I hope I pronouncing that. Yes, no, Augustine. Thank you very much. I'm with the California Emerging Technology Fund and just going back and the previous comments I think made some good points. We're really looking at students in low income communities, and we want to make sure that we're looking at the connectivity and the access as sort of a foundation. And in order to really help them address their needs and improve their situation. They need to, we need to make sure that we're helping students succeed and thrive, and I think the support to teachers, parents and students so that they know how to really maximize the impact of the technology is really important. And we really look at the ways that we're helping those groups work together, develop their skill sets, provide them the supports that they need, and I think that's the only way that we're gonna have the results, where not only are we having these devices and this connectivity available, but that it serves a purpose and really helps students address their needs. Thank you so much for that. Very much appreciate the feedback. Um...Bree. Hi! Everyone! Can you see me? My name is Bree Doan and I work with Canal Alliance. We're an organization located in San Rafael, California, serving the canal community, which is primarily an immigrant community with immigrants from Mexico and Central America. I run a program for English language learners, and it's completely online. Our biggest barrier is the availability of broadband, and whether that broadband is adequate. We are starting to sign students up for ACP and also Comcast Essentials. Often Comcast Essentials is not enough to actually be online in a zoom classroom and be able to have the functionality that you need with video and with other online programs. And then the second piece with digital literacy which we're bringing in as part of our classroom curriculum, basic computer hardware skills using the English keyboard, using email, Google documents, presentation skills...just basic things like finding files, bookmarking pages, Internet research, and all of these skills are something that our students need to learn in order to be able to participate in our classes and fully take advantage of the class, so I feel like it's definitely 2-fold with broadband plus the ability to have access to skills training. Thank you so much, Bree, I appreciate you really listing off a lot of the challenges that you're seeing there with the Canals. Jason. Thank you. Jason Borgen, chief technology innovations Officer for Santa Cruz County Office of Education. One thing we, we're working with our school districts on is building digital equity and literacy roadmaps. We received some funds for the California Department of Education foundation to support school districts in building these roadmaps. And actually, what we found is, there's a lot of frameworks out there, but like the SD standards, there is the UK standards around 6 different areas around digital literacy and equity, but it's kind of almost too much to chew for school districts. So, we kind of filter those into 3 main areas around digital literacy and equity. One is participation, one is safety, and one is being self-developed. And so, using those 3 areas around equity,

instruction and professional development is a little bit more of a mouth to chew on. We're working with 7 school districts, Sacramento County Office of Education, San Benito County Office of Education and some couple of school districts in Santa Cruz County specifically around helping them crowdsource actions they can build in these digital literacy roadmaps. And the idea is to create a 3-year plan of implementing digital literacy across their schools and districts by receiving both data around three different categories, these three different buckets or competencies we're calling, and then align them into these...this plan around equity, instruction, and professional development because obviously we want to build a staff, a staffing culture life-long for our young learners with digital literacy as well. Jason, Thank you so much, and I also want to just kind of highlight for everyone that that this is one of the many values of this group, and I hope that you continue to attend and spread the word about this because we're learning about what is out there, the efforts that are taking place, and it kind of leads into the second question, which is also talking about ways that you or your organization or your school district or your county office of ed, or what have you, is finding successful programs or scalable programs. So, Raena. I see...Winters. Yeah, thanks for having me. I'm Raena Lavelle, Director of Technology in Winters Joint Unified School District. We're a small school district with about 16 hundred students outside of Sacramento. Answering kind of questions 1 and 2 in a couple parts I guess. The biggest barriers we see come in 2 different categories. One is like hardware access and affordability. And so, a lot of our families can't afford a device. So, as a school district we went one-to-one, and we have provided chrome books for every family to use both as a student device and a family device at home in the evenings. But the next part of that is connectivity, right? We can provide a device. But if they don't have Internet at home, or if they can't afford Internet at home, then that device is essentially like an inexpensive paperweight. We provide hotspots. We have helped families join the Internet For All movements and kind of apply for some of that funded Internet access. But being a rural town, we only have 2 providers in the area, and some households and some areas that are especially out in the country don't have any kind of access, no cell service, no wi-fi of any kind. And so, we're seeing the digital divide between families that have and those that have not even wider and wider and wider, so as much as we can attack it on campus, the minute students leave campus and families are no longer on our school...you know, at school and that gap is just getting wider and farther apart, and it's something that we're all kind of struggling with in town. So, I'm here for all the solutions. Thank you, Raena. I look forward to having you participate in our upcoming meetings as well. Lewis. Please. Sorry. No worries, thank you. Good afternoon, folks. My name is Luis Wong from the Imperial County Office of Ed, and you know, I think one of the barriers here that is pretty common in some of our rural remote areas, like some of you mentioned, is some of the connectivity packed up pockets of places where there's no access. We certainly experience some of those, and I think I know there's a group on tribal, but one of the challenges, biggest challenges we've had is serving on tribal communities, and those are places where network infrastructure is really, really hard to implement because of the nature of their beliefs, and how they want to be part of their own sovereign nation and how they deal with those things. So, that's been a real big challenge for us. Another challenge that is pretty evident is the affordability piece, and even navigating through some of the plans or the broadband subsidy programs that are out there proved to be challenging where those offerings are really not exactly what families need. So, I think there's a lot of that still, you know, and even with subsidies in place. We just kind of find that sometimes the cost of broadband just goes up, you know. And so, that's something that we struggled a lot with and we're still seeing a lot of that. How did we solve some of this? We were very unique...in a unique position to provide our own private wireless system that we were able to implement and expand during the

pandemic. And it served well. One of the things we've learned through that process is that families relate well with educational institutions, so their schools and that intimate relationship with their students served as well to be able to provide them quick access to broadband where needed. We found that in some places our system allowed something we didn't expect, but complemented the capacity that families did not have with their existing provider. And so, that was reassuring in terms of what we were doing. And so, you know we found those things to be useful, and then we complemented where our network or wireless network would not be, would not reach folks we complemented with other offerings. So, there's not a single tool for solving broadband in your community. You know you're gonna really have to look at multiple ways of trying to get broadband to everybody. But affordability is one, and then hard to reach places like tribal communities is another big one that we really need to ensure that we solve through this process. Thank you. Thank you, Luis. Terry. How do you? My name is Terry Rodriguez, I'm on the Placer County Democratic Central Committee, and I'm also the chair of the Legislation Committee, and we have been following those broadband bills, especially as it concerns my area of Aubrey, California, where we're challenged by our rural area. And yeah, we're essentially a community in the trees. But all too often, you know, when I end meetings, my screen freezes up when I'm on the local broadband. I agree with some of the people that vindicating the broadband in this area cost a lot of money to get the adequate number data that you need in order to do whatever project that you're on. Once they reach that limit, then it costs more. So, there is that affordability process. The other thing is infrastructure, and that's what I'll just touch on because everybody else has covered everything else, but putting in the infrastructure for the broadband service to be adequate in our community. My example. My local broadband that I originally had is 2 megabits per second. That that's what we had and I had to suddenly go to another broadband service, because where our tower was located was on private property. The person who bought that property from the former owner wanted that tower off so it left me without broadband. We had to go over to another service. That service is with 6 megabits per second and that was also costly. But in order for them to gain...for me to gain access to broadband, they would have had to climb my 200 foot tree to put in a receptor. Somehow we avoided it. Now I offered that one particular company we went over...to put a tower on my property. They indicated the cost was too much, and yet I live on a hill. It has a view of all Sacramento Valley, and the tower they did put up is the bottom of my hill through trees, but it still worked, and I still get frozen activity. We went over the Starlink, which is working quite well, but this is the challenge that our area has is putting infrastructure in. My understanding, one of the bills is that they would prepare broadband fiber optics and I believe the bill called for taking a town, a rural town, hitting it to service, a fiber optic community but then to expand fiber optics into the hills along all roads. Now I think that's going to be a challenge. But will it be adequate, especially during your emergency services? What if we have a fire? What's gonna happen to that fiber optics? Starlink came through with a good plan. They have...they'll bring in a (...) in an emergency service, where they'll provide broadband to the locals until they get it re-established. But that infrastructure is going to take time, and in the meantime all those people that are going to need to be service that these gentlemen and ladies, excuse me, have indicated the need for is going to take time. I talk to...I have to say, my neighbor...because you know where I live, he's a leading authority on radio communications and he was indicating it's going to take some time to implement all this. So, I guess my question here at the end of all this is how long before we would have it all implemented down to Item 8, the rural communities. Thank you. Thank you, Terry. Really appreciate the comment. I'm gonna actually call on Scott Adams, just to kind of address a little bit of what's going on with some of the efforts that complement what we're doing with digital equity. And we can also put some additional information in

the chat for the programs that he's gonna mentioned. So, Scott. Yeah, Lauren. Thank you for calling on me. And also, this is such a great conversation of the community and the experiences that don't want to you know, it's not too much. But I do want to say that as many folks has indicated that access and infrastructure is so critical to the digital equity equation, and want to make sure that we provide you all with information about the middle-mile broadband initiative and the middle-mile broadband network that the State is constructing and putting together. That is a statewide network that will empower, you know, incumbent ISPs and in new entrants and other entities to develop last mile solutions in those hard to reach places. Also wanted to point out, and we'll share with you a link on the Public Utilities Commission broadband implementation page. They have a number of last mile infrastructure grant programs that support local communities and ISPs and others to develop this network solution. So, we really appreciate how critical a piece that is, and you know, want to make sure you're familiar. If you have any questions, reach out to us and Laura, I will go back to you to continue on this wonderful conversation. Great thanks, Scott! I wanted to introduce someone to the group here today. She's going to take Question 3. It also occurred to me that I did not introduce myself at the beginning of this entire session. So, for those of you who don't know me, Laura Sasaki. I'm: the broadband initiatives manager here at the California Department of Technology. My focus is on digital equity and digital literacy. And I'm also going to introduce Kamaljit Gill, she's one of our graduate student assistants who is helping support the Education Outcome Area Working group, and so Kamaljit is at UC Berkeley and this is part of what she is doing as her graduate and capstone studies. So, Kamaljit can you take Question 3, please? Yes, thank you so much everybody for this great conversation. Definitely been learning a lot. So, the last question we have today for this discussion part is would you please share any other reflections that you have. You might feel like that haven't been discussed today, or any digital equity questions in general. Thanks, Kamaljit. So, just to reinforce for everyone what we're looking for as part of this process is what are we missing? Right? So, we we've talked about some of the things that are kind of the baselines. Are you...you kind of always start with where are your assumptions, and where are you starting from? But what are we missing, and what are we leaving out as it pertains to education, the covered calculations that we've talked about, experiences that you've had yourselves. Is there...is there anything that we're like...we're just missing the vote on. So, please let us know either in chat, raise your hand, and let us know if there's anything that we can do to make this a better conversation in our in our upcoming meetings. Antonio? Yeah, good afternoon, everyone. I'm Antonio with Imperial County Office of Ed. Responsibilities includes technology, and I was a previous CTO at an elementary school district for 22 years, and that's where this kind of comes from. And first of all, thank you for putting the information together and getting us together and giving throughout the city of California the opportunity to have a voice. I think it's super important. Yeah. And what I wanted to talk about is the importance of chunking this and finding ways and strategies to communicate from superintendents down, and everyone connected. How this could be done without, you know, with the limited amount of time we have during the school day. So I and I like the fact that we're focusing on skills, right? That we're saying, You know what this is. These are the small tangible things that we could focus on. And this is a reason why and to have that focus and strategy, I think, being able to figure that out and provide those strategies, the holistic approach in regards to infrastructure professional development, you know initiatives, and that's great, I think as we can tie all this together is by making sure we're able to provide those. This is that information down to the school district level. So again, thank you very much, and I found the information very important. Thank you so much. Nellie, we're going to go with you, and then we are going to move on to our next section. So go ahead. Okay, now I'm unmuted. i'm thinking about children with disabilities

in the educational system, and a lot of parents who are low income immigrant backgrounds being able to afford, maybe a voice recognition software for students who have dyslexia might be cost prohibitive. So, having a resource center, or a resource page, or a person who's connected to in California. They call it ability tools, which is a center by which you can rent out the technology and test it out as an adult with the disability who I which I am. But I'm wondering if there's a resource for parents who are monolingual Spanish or other language speakers that they can go to or if the Department on Technology could create a partnership with ability tools, or ability tools in California to be able to create a resource for those parents that need the software for dyslexia, for example, for their children. Thank you so much. Really appreciate that and appreciate you for sharing your experience as well. It's ironic because you led into the next section without knowing it. Ad cause what we're gonna talk about next. I'm gonna hand it over to Rachna Vas. But before I do that, I'm just taking what you said and providing that context is that one of the things that we're going to be doing as part of this process is looking at what programs are out there in California right now. So, we don't know necessarily if there is a program like you ask about, but there might be. And so, part of what we're doing is trying to for a lack of a better term inventory that and find out what programs are out there and then come back with that and say, okay. These are the programs that we've identified, the practitioners and organizations that support this. And this is what the gap is, and so I'm going to turn it over to Rachna. But now I really wanted to thank you so much for that, and thank everyone for the very thoughtful discussion that we've been having, and again encourage you to continue having that in the chat, as you're hearing things, and as we, when we get to the end, we also have contact information. So, if you want to continue that outside of this, please feel free to do so. So Rachna. Thank you, Laura. Next slide. Next one. So you heard Scott Adams talked about the State digital equity planning process, and part of the planning process required a needs assessment, and you just had Laura talked a bit about that as well, and the beginning process of a needs assessment is to conduct an asset inventory of programs and services that are currently being offered throughout the State of California. And to begin with that process CDT has developed a tool called the Digital Equity ecosystem mapping Tool, or the DEEM tool. Next slide. The DEEM tool was created to trying to understand what programs and services are being offered where these programs and services are being offered, and to whom these programs and services are being offered across the State of California. The point of this is to understand what's working, what's missing, where there are gaps in resources and programs and services, and what region that those gaps might be occurring. And so we need to understand from you, as people who provide these services, what we can do better and what really is working right now. So, this is where we need your help as educators, as administrators, to help identify these programs and services throughout California. We are going to be disseminating this in the coming weeks. We're planning to launch this very soon. And just to let you know that we did do a thorough vetting process with a number of libraries and educators who gave us input in putting this tool together. Next slide. If you leverage technology to provide any program or any service, we want to know about it. So please Don't hesitate to fill out this tool. Don't hesitate to share this with other people, other nonprofits, that you may work with, community-based organizations, faith-based organizations. We want to hear from everybody what's being offered and what might be working particularly well. We want to showcase what's working well, and we want to address what is missing, so please help us by filling out this tool and sharing it with your Channel partners. Next slide. The other component of the needs assessments is going to target California residents. So, the DEEM tool targets organizations, entities and coalitions to understand what programs are being offered. The digital equity public survey helps us to identify barriers to digital equity for California residents. Next slide. So, one of the key components of the digital equity

public survey that we developed was to make sure that we were comprehensive and inclusive about the nature of the survey. So, we've developed the survey in 12 different languages to accommodate limited English proficiency communities. We've taken into consideration, all accessibility, features to make sure people with visual and auditory impairments can also complete this tool. So we want to make this as engaging and inclusive as possible because we want our California residents to tell us where they're identifying barriers to their own Internet accessibility to Internet affordability and Internet adoption in the household. We will be launching this in the coming weeks as well. And this, again, is another tool that we've vetted throughout the State of California with input from various organizations and state agencies as well. Next slide. So this tool that that we are currently offering for the digital equity public survey will be disseminated in all 58 counties in California, and we will oversample for the 8 covered populations. It will be offered in an online survey, as well as a phone survey, and we just wanted to give you a sense, a sneak peek of what that public survey might look like. So if you don't mind sharing the view of some of the questions that librarians and educators might see. All right. I guess we will go to this page. This is just an example of what the households might actually see when they're filling up this tool. So this will be in multiple languages, and we want to understand how people are using the Internet at home. And if you don't mind clicking on the other tab to show the DEEM tool, this is what we will be asking you. This is just a sample of some of the questions that we want to know from you, but what you're seeing, and what you're offering in the library and schools and higher education centers around California. We could go back to the main PowerPoint. Thank you. So again, these tools are critical in helping us to understand what's going on in the digital equity ecosystem across California. So whatever you can do to push this out to California households to complete so that we can get a good response rate would be much appreciated. And same thing with the DEEM tool. Please push that out with the people that you partner with, that you work with, so that we can get a good understanding of what programs and services are. Okay. And with that I'm going to turn this back over to Laura. Great. Thank you. Sorry about that. I think I have a motorcycle going by right now. So other ways to get involved in in the process. I think some of you have already done this, but we also are asking for you to sign up for updates on the broadband for all portal, which is essentially our website, with all things broadband, and we'll have somebody put that link in the chat. And I just also wanted to let folks know there have been a several questions. Yes, you will be getting the slides. We can send those out pretty quickly after this. And then we will also be posting transcripts recording and the slide deck up on the website as well. So, it will be, it will be there. So, number one we can. You can sign up for the updates. You'll receive email updates on events on things that are happening with digital equity. attend a local event. So, when Scott was talking about the different components that are our approach to digital equity, we will be having a local and regional events. And those will be posted on the website as well, once we have those dates and locations available. And also completing and sharing the digital equity public survey with friends and families and community members. That is just to kind of reiterate separate from the digital equity ecosystem mapping tool. So we have 2 different surveys going on. So next slide, please. Okay. So next step. So this was our kind of inaugural and kickoff. It was actually our very first outcome area working group meeting that we've had, and there will be several more. We have, as Scott also indicated, 6 total outcome areas. And so if you have an interest in attending those as well, we would love to hear your input and in those areas, especially if you have interest in that, not just the education outcome area. But you may have programs that you work with in that service other areas as well. So, the next step for this working group for education will be helping kind of develop strategies that align with the digital equity planning priorities that we talked about, and a big part of that is really just kind of the conversation that

we have going on today. As well as gathering that information from the surveys. Conducting a gap analysis. So, taking a look at again where we find that we stand in California, and where the gap is between that, and actually achieving digital equity. And then, taking all of that information and data that we are gathering throughout this process, and I think we've said a few times that it's a month long process and using those to provide recommendations from the Education outcome area working group up to the Department of Technology for inclusion in the digital equity plan. And we had a question sorry just to addressing something that popped up in chat. That will be up on the broadband for all website. And if I could just ask team member of mine to post where the past events will be, because that's where it will be listed. Next slide, please. Okay. So, just a kind of a sneak peek on the future meetings that we're going to be having. We are gonna have 3 more. We have one in March. We have May, and we have June. We are skippy in April, but those are the next 3 meetings. So for March we're taking a look at how does digital inequity creates disparities in in education. May is, what digital equity programs are currently working well, and what's missing. And then June is once we've started kind of really gathering that data. It's also using the public survey and DEEM data to help with those recommendations for the digital Equity Plan. And Scott, I see you have your hand up so feel free to jump in. Yeah, thanks. Laura just wanted to point out that Rachna talked about both the digital equity survey and the digital equity mapping tool. Those are not live yet, so there'll be live, and you know imminently, but I think a link was posted. Those are our test links, so wanted to. We know how busy you all are. Please don't go to those things and try to fill them out. We'll make sure that we distribute those widely to you when they're live. Back to you, Laura. Thank you. Public service announcement right there. Do not spend time on filling them out yet. But we, we will ask for you to, you know make those widely available, distribute those out with in the groups that you work with, just because you know we need to get as much information back as possible. We also recognize that some of the conversations and upcoming topics are probably going to have some overlap. So, we really just want to encourage the conversation to continue both during these meetings, when we have them publicly as well as again offline, and I think we have contact information in the next slide. So, next slide, please. Not quite there. So, let's go back to the timeline. Just want to give you guys an overall look at the timeline, and where we are right now for the digital equity timeline. So, we've kind of highlighted our group in red in recognition of where we are today with the education working group. We are kind of in about a third of the way through our tentative timeline for the digital equity planning process. So, this just gives you an idea of what the next steps are that we have, and where those fall on the calendar. And so, in the upcoming months we'll be taking a look at those different components of the mapping exercise, taking a look at the programs and providers and services that are out there, taking a look at the gaps, and then putting together the recommendations. Right now, we are hoping to have the draft plan, and I'm just gonna flag this one that we're probably going to have the draft plan ready for public comment sometime in late summer, early fall. And Jackie, I am seeing your question in the chat. Should those who fill out surveys expect that their surveys responses will be public, and then we'll everyone get to see the responses the CDT receives. Rachna, I'm going to let you or Scott actually respond to that. Maybe, Scott. I should be happy to respond to. No. Your survey responses are confidential, and they are anonymous. Nothing is nothing. We don't collect any personally identifiable information through the DEEM tool or through the public survey. So what we're trying to do is collect is; aggregate the data and set it up in data visualization tools that we will post on the CDT broadband for all portal. I hope that answers your question, Jackie. And I think, as you guys saw. The next slide is for Q and A. So we've got about 5 min left, and I just want to see if anybody just has any lingering questions or comments that they want to add. And I'll give it just a minute to raise a hand if you do. All right, seeing

that. Oh, Phil, there you go. I'm gonna call out something that Scott and the conversation on the Survey form had an email back to me. We've all got to be part of the answer of how is this survey gonna to get distributed? And by using our networks information will be richer. And so yeah, we'll all do our part. So thank you guys, for thinking so holistically about visual inclusion. Thank you, Phil. Thank you so much for the support. All right, if we can go to the next slide. We would love to hear from you, so thank you to everyone for your time here today, for taking the time to spend with us for the conversation that we saw going back and forth in chat. And we really want to encourage you to share this meeting with other colleagues and counterparts and interested parties, so that as we go forward we continue to have more and more robust discussion and feedback. In the interim, if you want to reach us at the Department of Technology Office of Broadband and Digital Literacy, we have a general digital equity email that is, for this process. And that is the email address that's up there again. You'll have these slides. So you will have our contact information. If you want to contact those of us that were on, that were presenting today, or helping support, we have our contact information there, and please feel free to reach out to us. We would love to, you know, continue the conversation. We look forward to getting together again, and I am so sorry I should know the date and time for the next one, and I have someone put that in chat for me. But at our upcoming meetings. So, I think do we have any more slides, Mel? Thank you. There you go. Thank you. Everyone so much for joining us on this February fourteenth of 2023, and we look forward to seeing you at our March meeting. Thank you.