

State Digital Equity Planning: Statewide Planning Group Meeting #4
Agenda and Executive Summary

Date: October 25, 2023 | Time: 1:30 PM PST

The Statewide Digital Equity Planning Group met on Wednesday, October 25, 2023 at 1:30 p.m. PST via virtual conference.

Agenda Item 1: Welcome and Overview

Name	Title/Organization	Attendance
Liana Bailey-Crimmins	Director, California Department of Technology	Yes
Darcie Houck	Commissioner, California Public Utility Commission	Yes
Monisha Avery	Chief Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion; Office of Emergency Services	No
Lizzy Williamson	Department of General Services	No
Geoff Belleau	California Department of Education	Yes
Robert Peterson	California Department of Food & Agriculture	Yes
Sunne McPeak	California Emerging Technology Fund	Yes
Lori Pepper	Deputy Secretary, California Transportation Agency	Yes
Josh Chisom	California State Library	Yes
Loretta Miranda	Deputy Secretary, Governor's Office of Tribal Affairs	Yes
Pam Chueh	Chief Equity Officer, Government Operations Agency	Yes
Joleah Jackson	Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development	Yes
Brian Carter	California Department of Aging	Yes
Kristin Montgomery	California Department of Correctional Rehabilitation	Yes

Hayley Figeroid	California Office of Data and Innovation	Yes
Elena Costa	Department of Public Health	Yes
Jacob Johnson	Department of Rehabilitation	Yes
Sarah Poss	Housing and Community Development	Yes
Isaiah Mall	California Department of Veterans Affairs	No
Tommy Fanner	California Department of Social Services	Yes
Derek Kirk	Labor and Workforce Development Agency	Yes
Tracy Rhine	Rural Counties Representative of California	Yes

Speakers/Presenters		
Scott Adams	Deputy Director, Office of Broadband and Digital Literacy, California Department of Technology	X
Darcie Houck	Commissioner, California Public Utilities Commission	X
Gladys Palpallatoc	Federal Program Officer/State Lead, California, NTIA	X
Anh Nguyen	Operations and Engagement Manager, Office of Broadband and Digital Literacy	X
Sunne McPeak	CEO & President, California Emerging Technology Fund	X
Rob Osborn	Director of Communications Division, California Public Utilities Commission	X
Danny Fuchs	Principal, Broadband Equity Partnership	X

Agenda Item 2: General Updates

Scott Adams explained SDEP's approach and scope of engagement. He also shared a slide with a high-level view of the work that has been done to gather data. No questions were asked by members of the Statewide Planning Group (SPG).

Commissioner Darcie Houck provided a detailed update on Broadband Equity, Access, and Deployment (BEAD) program. She went over the timeline of BEAD through 2025. No questions were asked by members of the Statewide Planning Group. Scott Adams highlighted the no-cost extension that California received.

Agenda Item 3: NTIA Comments and Updates

Gladys Palpallatoc discussed the no-cost extension and upcoming next steps and funding opportunities. She then provided an update on the NOFO for the capacity grant expected in 2024. No questions were asked by members of the Statewide Planning Group.

Agenda Item 4: State Digital Equity and BEAD Planning Process Update

Scott Adams provided an update on the State Digital Equity Plan's vision, goals and objectives as well as potential uses of capacity grants. He then introduced Sunny McPeak to discuss the Statewide Digital Equity Telephone Survey. Sunne provided the data that was acquired by the telephone surveys. The data spoke to those who are under and unconnected in California. Scott Adams then introduced Danny Fuchs to discuss the Statewide Digital Equity Public Online Survey. Danny also discussed the Digital Equity Ecosystem Mapping (DEEM) tool. Scott Adams reviewed implementation strategies and key activities for the Statewide Digital Equity Plan. Madam Chair Bailey-Crimmins asked for a clearer picture of what we can expect once we have received all the data.

Agenda Item 6: SDEP Public Comment Process

Scott Adams explained the coming 45-day public comment process. He shared a timeline containing new milestones through Q3 of 2024. No questions were asked by members of the Statewide Planning Group.

Agenda Item 7: BEAD Plan Process Update

Robert Osborn expanded on what Commissioner Houck shared earlier on the new BEAD timeline. No questions were asked by members of the Statewide Planning Group.

Agenda Item 8: Q&A/Public Comment

Questions were asked by Wally Siembab, Alex Elliot, Arlene Krebs, Josh Butler and Teresa Valenzuela. Questions were asked on the Zoom Q&A box and Laura Sasaki verbalized questions. SPG members and presenters responded accordingly.

Transcript

The director of the Department of Technology and today you're going to receive updates regarding the State Digital Equity Planning Work Group. There's been a lot of progress made. We want to apologize for our delayed start time. We had another board meeting that ran over but out of respect for your time hopefully, you can attend as much as possible of this particular meeting, because there's a lot of great progress has been made. This is our last work, correct me if I'm wrong, this is our last working group meeting in 2023. And so we want to definitely highlight all the accomplishments as we look at several updates that we'll be receiving today. The first is going to be from Scott Adams, the Deputy Director of Broadband and Digital Literacy is going to talk about all the hard work that's commenced in order to draft the State Digital Equity Plan. You're going to get a progress update. From that. We also are lucky to have Commissioner Houck from the California Public Utilities Commission and she's going to provide updates regarding Broadband Equity Access and Deployment, also known as the BEAD program. We also have who is one of the California's federal program officers from the National Telecommunications Information Administration, also known as NTIA. Following. Gladys will then have talk about a multi-prong approach where we're getting comments from the planning group and then we'll use the Zoom function, so if you are on Zoom and you have questions or want to be called on, please raise your hand and we will make sure that you are activated to be able to provide your public comment. And then finally, we'll conclude by just making sure that there are opportunities to provide comments from the public with that. I'd like to go ahead and, looking at the notes, why don't we go ahead and go ahead and do the summary from Mr. Scott Adams. All right, Mr. Adams, you want to go ahead and give an update? Thank you. Sorry. I'm getting a little feedback on my computer. Let me stop that great. If you could go back to the proceeding slide, please. And

welcome everyone Scott Adams, Deputy Director of Broadband and Digital Literacy California Department of Technology, wanted to give you a brief update. So now, if we could go to the next slide. What we really wanted to do is highlight, is, that is Director Bailey-Crimmins said. This is the fourth meeting of the year. The first meeting was just in January, and really there was the kickoff that occurred before in October. But if you look at this simple, graphic right here of what is transpired over the last 10 months, the joint collaboration between CDT and the Public Utilities Commission other broadband council members and folks from across the State. We've generated close to 50,000 or over 50,000 engagement opportunities for individuals and organizations to have their voice be heard into, weigh in and provide input on the Digital Equity Plan that today, we're going to kind of walk you through with its you know, posting for public comment in the next few weeks nearing us with my give you an update on how we got there. But this was really the high level slide that we wanted to share is that this kind of quantifies all the joint work that we've been doing together to solicit input and information, both qualitative and quantitative data. So back to you Chair Bailey-Crimmins. Thank you very much. Is there any questions or comments from any of the working group, the digital equity working group members. Is there online? Is there anybody online? And okay, then I'd like to go ahead. And the next is, I just want to make sure I'm doing this in right order is an update from regarding the depart speed. Okay, sorry. We're a little bit out of order. So the next one will be an update from this looks like your slide, Scott, I just want to make sure, are you? Yeah, I know we're a little bit out of order. So okay, alright, Commissioner Houck. Once we go ahead and have you go up next? Thank you. And good afternoon again. I'm Darcie Houck, one of the 5 Commissioners at the California Public Utilities Commission. And this afternoon I'll be providing an update on the CPUC's Broadband Equity Access in Deployment or BEAD program which is a critical tool for California in achieving its goals for Broadband for All. So on this first slide. I'll provide an overview of the program. In late June, the National Telecommunications and Information Administration announced that California was allocated 1.86 billion dollars in federal funding from the BEAD program, which was part of the infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act of 2021 central goal of the BEAD program is to deploy reliable last mile service to all unserved locations in California and unserved means lacking speeds. At least 25 megabits per second download and 3 megabits per second upload via reliable technology meaning a wireline connection or licensed fixed wireless federal rules require prioritization of end to end fiber, fiber deployments. But where this is not feasible, fixed wireless and other technologies can be used as an alternative. The PUC is implementing the BEAD program for California and is in the process of establishing program rules through our public deliberative process. And we have opened a proceeding, and the proceeding number is R. 2302016. To develop rules for determining the various processes for distributing BEAD funds throughout California, and the rules are subject to approval by the NTIA. So this slide includes additional background and information on the BEAD website and subscriptions for program updates. So if you have access to the electronic slides, there are links on

the slide to get that additional information. And now, I'm going to go to the next slide, please. So the next slide that has a timeline that gives an overall perspective on the multi-year implementation process for BEAD. The Commission just completed its initial wave of public engagements, and we partnered with the California Department of Technology over the summer the feedback from these 21 public and tribal engagements will help the PUC. As we develop the required initial proposal that complies with federal rules and NTIA requirements. So there were 17 community engagement meetings and 4 tribal consultations, including one virtual consultation. We're going to continue to coordinate with the California Department of Technology and planning outreach activities and aligning the digital equity planning with BEAD. as CDT is the designated entity for the State Digital Equity plan as just discussed by Deputy Director Scott Adams. the 5 Year Action Plan. I'm going to talk about that for a second, if you'll see on here. We accepted opening comments through August seventh and reply comments through August eleventh. The plan and all of the comments were submitted to NTIA at the end of August. On the chart, here you'll see that from August through December we are in the process of developing the initial proposal, which will include rules for the BEAD challenge and sub grantee selection processes as well as other requirements for program administration. We intend to seek input on the initial proposal from a wide set of stakeholders as well as the broader public via written comments, a technical workshop and public hearings and listening sessions. We will also release a draft version of the initial proposal for public comment before it is submitted to the NTIA for approval, and the initial proposal is due to NTIA. By the end of 2023, which means we have a short timeframe by CPUC norms to get input on many different program elements from interested entities. So I want to highlight a few things that are upcoming that are also reflected on the timeline. We'll be holding a technical workshop for parties and stakeholders tomorrow, October 26th here in Sacramento. It will also be hybrid. So people can participate both in person and virtually. We will have 2 public virtual participation hearings that will be held on November eighth, one at 2 pm and one at 6 pm. And that is, for the public to be able to call in and provide comments. There'll be a transcript of that hearing and that will be part of the administrative record for the proceeding. The staff proposal will be issued. Hopefully in early. We're into targeting early November to issue the staff proposal, and that will inform the state's initial proposal under BEAD. And again, early November is when we're targeting release and we'll be taking public comments on the staff proposal and reviewing and incorporating those public comments into the proposal that will be submitted to NTIA. We'll also be holding a listening session in Southern California, and we're targeting November 20, eighth for that date. And again, written comments will be accepted from stakeholders and the public throughout the process, and there's also a link on the docket for the proceeding where the public can put public comments directly into the docket as well. In early 2024 we anticipate NTIA will approve the initial proposal which will then enable us to first begin the challenge process and then begin selecting sub grantees through a competitive process described in the initial proposal. All of this will get wrapped up

into the final proposal that goes to NTIA, which will be due 365 days after the initial proposal is approved, and this must all be made available for public comment before it's submitted to NTIA. So, after approvals of the final proposal, the CPUC will receive the funds from the federal government and make formal awards to the proposed grantees. Concurrently, the PUC is also working on readying for the administration of this large and complex program. We're currently recruiting program staff and working on contracting to develop the systems and structures needed to implement the program. And so I know it was mentioned earlier this morning that we will be eligible for 20% of the initial funding after volume one is approved, and then the other 80% would be what would be awarded after the final proposal is approved. And I that will conclude my comments on the BEAD program. And we also have Director Osborn here, too, in case there's questions. He can provide technical answers and more specifics as well. Thank you, Commissioner. Now are there any planning group comments, questions either in the room or online? Well, I do. Want to just take a moment and just again, thank Commissioner, how CPUC leadership, Robert Osborn. For your leadership. Your. It's been a great partner over the last several years on really making this happen. Because we know that between middle mile that's just the digital highway. We need the off ramps and the ability to connect communities. And you are aware that that connection that partnership happens. And so everything you guys are doing is making a difference. And we just want to thank you very much for everything that you have done. And really that opportunity to make sure the public is involved in everything that CPU is doing in relation decision making. So thank you very much. Is there another? I did miss content on one slide that I should include in this section, if you will allow me regarding BEAD not regarding BEAD. Mr. Adams. Any other comments or questions regarding last mile and BEAD? Alright, I see none. And so, Mr. Adams, you wanted to go back to your prior agenda item and highlight a slide that you had missed. Yeah, it's well, it's the same. It's just in the general digital equity and be plan updates which are combined. There was a slide there that showed a key piece of information on the next slide up. I believe it is that as a result of the digital equity planning process evolving with and NTIA that the state had, in addition. you know, on behalf of California, we had applied for no-cost extension to accommodate the new guidance from things that need be considered. We did reference that in our newsletter, but we did not. This is the first opportunity to share with the state planning group. So just going to extend and stretch our timeline a little bit. And something to know is that given that the timelines going to be stretched. We're also extending the public comment period, which will come in sometime soon to 45 days. So, thanks, director. thank you. That's very important. I think many states are doing the 30 day minimum. And I just want to commend California leadership to decide to open up the comment, the public comment to 45 days. We feel like it's important that Digital Equity Plan should represent be representative of the community. And so that allows more people to have the opportunity to voice their updates or concerns. If there's anything that they feel needs to be edited. So thank you, Mr. Adams. We'll go ahead and go to the next agenda item, and that is

an NTIA, a update from Gladys. Palpallatoc. Hi, thank you. Thank you, Director. Good morning. Ever. Good afternoon, everybody. I'm Gladys Palpallatoc and I'm one of 2 federal program officers for California from the National Telecommunications and Information Administration or NTIA. We're working both with CDT and CPU C on their administration of the digital equity and broadband equity access and deployment or BEAD programs. You heard. And we'll hear detailed updates from CDT and CPUC. This afternoon, and I'm here to give just a few more details on the no-cost extension and upcoming next steps and funding opportunities. On the no-cost extensions. NTIA. Encourage all the states and territories in the country to submit no-cost extensions to ensure enough time for a full curing or review processes of their final state. Digital equity pro plans, and 51 states and territories requested no-cost extensions. Reviews are underway, and approvals should be forthcoming very soon. And the Secretary, or Assistant Secretary himself, is doing those reviews and approvals next up next year. Once the State Digital Equity Plan is, sub are submitted. Capacity grant. No phos are the notice of funding. Opportunities are expected, and Q by the end of in 2024 the capacity grants are for states to implement their State Digital Equity Plans. State allocations will be by formula similar to the planning grant. Allocations last year states will administer their capacity grants. And so those competitions will be within the state. come, likely sub grants for digital equity. Types of work are going to be the types of efforts. That will be sub awarded and the NOFO again, is anticipated by the end of Q1 or beginning of, and NTIA will need to review, then review applications and get grants out to the states. And then states, after they receive the grants will need to develop and shape their programs to implement the grant and so you see, there'll be some time for organizations. Around the state to prepare for this funding opportunity that's coming up the second funding opportunity that will come next year. Is our competitive grants that will be administered by NTIA, so the competition will be on at the national level. They are also meant to give grants for digital equity types of work and NTIA will be the administrator of those grants. The NOFO are, as anticipated, halfway through 2024, or the end of Q2 or beginning of Q3. NTIA will need then need to review applications and get grants out accordingly. So the timeline is fluid. It's their estimates, for when those NOFOs are coming out, but it's something that organizations can and again anticipate for now and prepare for, so that your applications are ready and your projects are ready. This concludes our update, and happy to take any questions. We have time and thank you again for having us. Thank you, Ms. Palpallatoc. It's always wonderful to hear from NTIA. Is there any comments or questions from any of the work group members not online. Okay? Well, thank you very much. Again, for your update. And we're now going to transition to get an update regarding the California Digital Equity Plan. This includes the plan components, including key findings and an overview of the overall public comment process. Mr. Adams, would you mind introducing your team members that are going to be participating in this. Update it just if you could do that for each section, you'll just re introduce them, as you kind of can keep going through. Okay, thank you. Well, hello again. And as the director said, we just wanted to give folks

you can advance to the next slide, please. Just really an understanding of, you know, we've done all the work of engaging and getting the qualitative and quantity of data. Now, we're in the process of finishing up the draft which we need to put out for public comment. So we wanted to remind folks of what to be looking for and how the digital equity plan came together. So what you see on the left hand side of this screen, or some of the key components of what you'll find in the digital equity plan. So vision goals and objectives, measurable objectives. You know a section on our process of engagement stakeholder and asset inventory needs assessment bears for covered populations and implementation strategies. want to really make sure that people are focused on what's on the right side of this screen, which are the digital equity plan is, going to take all of our input shape. You know how we will implement the plan, and then the capacity grants that Gladys spoke of will, you know, help the state implement, those, and what will distinguish this from a lot of the other big broadband for all efforts that are going on right now is that less about infrastructure and more about the programmatic things like broadband adoption efforts, digital literacy, training, digital navigation device, distribution workforce training programs. So that's the lens through which to kind of look at the draft when it comes out. Next slide, please. What? We also wanted to just kind of repurpose the or refocus, the planning group and the members of the public that are here participating is that foundational to the State Digital Equity Plan. Was really coming up with specific measures, objectives that are informed by all of the 5 components of the planning process. So the Statewide Planning Group here this was that all of government expanding the Broadband Council, bringing in those key government entities at the state level that have expertise. It was the input and the really great subject matter expertise that folks brought to the 6 outcome area working groups. Had 4 meetings each of those. So 24 total but really great. Enrich information that informed the plan. Then there's the digital equity surveys which you're going to hear about in more detail. From Sunne McPeak and Danny Fuchs from Broadband Equity Partnership. But then the local and regional planning workshops those were key to us, getting together with residents and community leaders to not just identify barriers. But I really identify strategies from a local perspective that would work and then ongoing public engagement, which is really summarizes a lot of different touch points that we've been able to do. So really, the first slide was about. Here's what the plans going to include, here's how we're going to fund it and what can be funded. This piece is like, these are the inputs that you know, all informed by you all and your contributions the contents of the plan. So next slide, please. Now, this is the place where we're going to go into a little more detail on the statewide digital equity survey. There were 2 surveys that were focused on understanding the needs of residents and specifically members of the covered populations, and then one that focused on organizational needs. And so, Sunne McPeak from CETF. We partnered with them to do a groundbreaking telephone survey. Sunne, do you want to walk us through some of the findings? Thank you. Deputy Director Adams, you said earlier today in the California Broadband Council meeting that this was an unprecedented survey. To be sure, I think it is the most I

know for sure. It is the most comprehensive ever done in California. I'm not aware of any other more comprehensive survey ever on digital equity in the country. The top lines, if we can advance. And to that slide. Thank you very much is that there are 91% of Californians who are connected to the Internet today. and that breaks out in the pie chart that you see there. Green, 88% are connected at the speeds that are the standards for California. 3% are under connected, and we identify them as having a smart phone only. So it's 91% that are connected. This is the same methodology. I should say that has been used since 2,008 in the statewide survey on, on broadband adoption. and that that is the same as 2 years ago in terms of the total who are connected and 9% are unconnected, totally not connected to the Internet. Some of the reasons are they can't afford it, or they don't have high speed, Internet access where they where they live. The good news here is that that is a 50% unconnected of what was the figure 2 years ago. So cutting from 6% unconnected under connected to 3% is no small task. And in California keep in mind. Each percentage point is a hundred 29,000 households. It is a much larger piece of the population than for any other state. Okay, next slide. What I'm going to go through and show you very quickly is trend lines that will show progress for all 8 cover populations and actually all 10. Because, remember, we have 2 additional covered populations for the BEAD program, all of which were surveyed, all of which the data is presented. And you can see the top line are those who are connected going back to 2,008. So there's been a lift from 53% to 91% the bottom line is when we started to really break out when smartphones became so prevalent who was connected with a smartphone only. So that's the under connected line, and you can see how we've continued to narrow that gap. Really good news getting into the hands of households, multiple devices to serve their many needs. What I'm going to go through as we go to the next slides are. Some of the key population are all in the full report that the Department of Technology has. But just looking at this slide is all the regions. And while there's ups and downs over time, you can see the convergence at the end, where all regions have had significant increase in adoption. The next slide are those by household income, which is very, very important, I think, to all of us, in the in the sense of digital equity. The bottom trend line are those who are the lowest income. and they have actually begun to really climb and reach towards you know, closing the digital divide in a way that is very tangible. what the next slide shows is and a sobering analysis that we did with all the data as to the percentage of each covered population who's unconnected, and then aligning that to poverty. So the bottom line on all of this is, there is an extraordinary association to poverty for the percentage of the pop that are the covered populations who are not connected. Therefore the sub. If you look at the those who are who are low income and unconnected, you will see greater percentages of every other covered population represented there. Who are the segments not connected. So concentration of poverty that you can study, and the next line goes to looking at race in this back forward and yes to the next slide. It'll show you. There we go the trend lines on ethnicity and minority populations. One of the 10 covered populations. Again, if you, the previous slide, showed of those who

identify as one of the minority groups or ethnic populations. Those who are unconnected happen to also be poor. That's what's meant by association extraordinary over representation. But the good news is on the following slide is that all of the populations again, have had significant increases in adoption. But when we are talking about each covered population. We need to understand that the vulnerability economically is one of those cross-cutting demographics, and then the next slide will show you one of the population groups we have always focused on and have an overlay. Whether it's an employment program or adoption program is people with disabilities. And this is huge. So the efforts among the trusted messengers who are the primary service providers to people with disabilities, the state agencies, the Department of Rehabilitation, all of the regional agencies have done a tremendous job. You can see it is literally a gap that is about 3% representing the overall population. And then the next slide that we have just the final for the statewide random digit dialing methodology is the same. A question posed to all of the participants. In this case our performance goal was more than 3,200, and we exceeded that at 3,500 is to ask, what are the reasons why you are not connected at home with Internet. and they range from it. I can't afford it to. It's too complex. I'm concerned about cyber security. It doesn't matter to me. Hardly anybody says that anymore. And I or I don't have access to the infrastructure. And so in the first question to everybody. You're asked, what are all the reasons? So you can have multiple choices. And then, once that question is answered in order to get a true ranking. You ask, what is the primary reason why you can't. and you'll see on the right hand side that it is still. Its affordability. The very last bar is, I don't have access to the infrastructure. So it is cost that continues to be an overriding barrier for covered populations. Not being connected to the Internet. I think that concludes the report. Thank you. Sunny, so much. Now wanted to welcome. Oh, I see Danny Fuchs from Broadband Equity Partnership. He is going to walk through the next couple of slides the components and talk about the complementary online. digital equity survey. That was done, the digital equity ecosystem map and some other things. So, Danny, welcome. Thank you so much. Deputy Director Adams. You can see here an update of the map that we shared with you in July. With the total reach of this online survey that complemented the telephone survey to reach more than 40,000. What we wound up showing on the bottom here is the number of valid responses after you account for people that only answered a few questions, but no questions of substance. Related to their accessibility to broadband and their use of the services. So we have more than 36,000 that wound up, contributing and sharing their voice and experiences in this online survey in a complementary way to the telephone survey. And you can see on the right here. How many different responses are valid in each of the 14 languages that the survey was made available in. So you can. There's the data in this is really representative of the hard work of significant outreach partners that helped to get more than 40,000 responses to the survey overall next slide, please. What this slide shows is 2 things that shows the distribution of the responses in the online survey relative to the distribution of populations of these covered populations in the State. That's what the chart is. And on the right

you can see the total number of responses. So what the left shows is that this survey overall significantly over sample for populations, including aging individuals, individuals and households below 150% of the federal poverty line individuals primarily residing in rural areas. But the overall sample does under sample for individuals for immigrants or for individuals with limited English proficiency. Nonetheless, the number of responses on the right does show just how significant the sample size you have for those populations. So Sunne mentioned that the telephone survey, for example, which did reach a representative sample of Californians, reached more than 3,500 individuals. even though immigrants are significantly underrepresented in the overall data. Here still 33, more than 3,300 immigrants responded to this survey, so that we can understand that the immigrant experience, more deeply as compared to what the overall looks like next slide. So to get that depth of information, you can start to see some highlights from different covered populations. So we know that aging individuals, for example, tens of thousands of them who responded feel less comfortable with basic digital skills compared to other populations. households below a hundred 50% to the federal poverty line. More than 10,000 households who responded to this survey site cost as a primary barrier, in addition to lack of an affordable necessary device. So, for example, 77% of those more than 10,000 respondents to this survey wound up, saying that they do not adopt Internet service because it is too expensive. Additionally, 23% of those households do not adopt, be do not use anything other than a smartphone to access the Internet. Other examples of the depth of this data show individuals residing primarily in rural areas that they are significantly constrained by lack of the quality of infrastructure that they have, and their choices and individuals with disabilities. Site cost is a primary barrier as well as lack of comfort with basic digital literacy. These are just some examples of the depth that you can get through those significant sample sizes on the individual covered populations in the survey as compared to an understanding of the State as a whole which is best viewed through the telephone survey next slide, please. You can see in this sample that similar to the telephone survey. 88% of respondents here are connect were connected to the Internet, but different. This. This survey wound up, reaching many more who were under connected rather than unconnected. Next slide. and also similar to the to the other survey. Home Internet services are too expensive is the primary reason why people are not adopting. Nonetheless, here on in this sample, you wind up seeing how many are not adopting the Internet because it's not available or adequate where they live. Next slide, we'll get into the digital equity ecosystem mapping. So as a part of the planning process, identifying assets and organizations and programs that are available to help address those barriers that are found in those surveys. Was a critical component of it. And one of the elements of getting of understanding the assets that are available to communities was through this digital equity ecosystem mapping tool that wound up surveying more than 470 organizations. And actually in, included more than 700 programs across the State. You can see that that included community anchor institutions, government and public organizations and programs, as well as private

and Ngo programs through this and the next slide will show what some of the key findings. So 4 key themes at the top included. General lack of this should actually say funding availability. I think we talked a lot about broadband availability. But for these organizations it's general lack of funding availability, their lack of staff and organizational capacity. The challenges of managing many different levels. Layered funding streams to deliver programs as well as an increased program cost delivering related to without increases in funding so issues related to funding availability and the complexity of funding for these organizations and programs is a key gap that CDT is looking to address through the statewide digital equity plan. But an additional one is this hesitancy and reluctance to enroll or participate in programs. There is an issue of trust that is back, that is, that is a part of addressing the digital divide and ensuring in particular that low income households can wind up enrolling in low cost programs that are necessary to get their adoption of the Internet back over to you, Deputy Director Adams, for the next slide. Thanks so much, Danny, and so folks. You kind of heard that that. And these are the You know the inputs from the surveys that you're going to see sprinkled not sprinkled, but cited heavily throughout the digital equity plan. On the implementation strategies and a key activities. Section what we wanted to say is, it's a long plan. It's over a hundred pages. But broadly, the implementation strategies and activities can be narrowed down to these broad themes. 7 themes that were really you know, of strategies and activities that were elevated through the outcome area working groups and the state planning group in the regional workshop. So really expediting, completing existing broadband infrastructure. Continuing to convene digital equity stakeholders to strengthen collaboration. We heard from people keeping these structures in place. evolving brought in in digital equity data and maps was, you know, something we heard launching a California connect core or digital equity grant program to expand community based digital navigation digital inclusion programs, fund and expand existing state manage digital inclusion programs. develop and promote digital inclusion tools and best practices. And then this is something that came up in the in the Broadband Council meeting earlier today. And acknowledgement throughout that to supported affordability and adoption that programs like the affordable connectivity program were useful tools that they're much needed. Given the cost that folks are paying and what they're actually receiving. But there's a need to align and either advocate for or develop another consumer subsidy program to create sustainability of affordability. Over the long term. And so that, concludes this section. Director, if there are any questions. Thank you, Mr. Adams, and all of the presenters on this topic. I'll open it up to my the working group the planning working group and see if there are any comments or questions. Do I see any in the room? Do we have anything online? I do have a question that I always want to try to. Always, you know. leave mine for last. Always put everyone else up first. But you know this. This is obviously great work across the state. You know. It's closer to 200 pages at least what I've seen on the draft so far. It's the outreach with the planning work group. It is the outreach that's been happening amongst communities. I know we're going to talk about public com, public comment

process. But what are people going to expect from this. So one of my roles is the state, CIO. And when I hear about some of this information, you know, when I, when we talk about more people are accessing. They're getting connected. But they're getting connected via a cell phone. Many of our services are web based or portal based in order to apply for some of the services within the state. And so you know, maybe our focus as we're thinking about the it community focusing on mobile first, or individuals that have fear, and they need advocacy, not just customer service. And so really looking on how we can continue to bridge the gap while we're also dealing with. How do we provide connectivity, affordability and equity? So, Mr. Adams, I know you've been. This is near and dear to your heart. But is there things kind of like what you see this kind of evolving into after we've collected all this data? Oh, the world evolving into hopefully, a very clear and coherent plan on how? we can. first demonstrate that we've understood the common, and the very unique digital equity barriers for the covered populations. That we understand the impacts? And communicate those through the plan about how digital equity our digital inequity creates disparate outcomes in key policy priority areas for the state and how digital equity will empower equitable outcomes in those key policy priority areas. So, folks that we've deliberately convened with around education. Health workforce and economic development access to essential services. Accessibility. So participation and tribal collaboration. Those were, the focus is. And so what this plan is aims to do is to share with folks what we've heard and what we've learned that this is a plan. When you take together the significant investments and infrastructure through the Middle Mile Broadband Initiative, and when they are connected to the suite of programs that the public utilities doing on last mile connectivity, that that this plan will outline how we can work with existing assets and resources that the state has to really get to digital equity and empower those outcomes. And so the question you asked about groups, there are sections about in the plan for state departments for local agencies, about how? If they're an entity providing digital services? They are encouraged to become digital equity champions and broadband adoption champions. And you know some steps that they can take both incremental and large scale to. To further. you know, facilitate digital equity, because at the end of the day we all succeed. When digital equity is achieved, those entities that want to provide services. DMV's of great example. they see great promise, and being a partner on promoting the affordable connectivity plan because they want to deliver digital services, they realize there's some inequitable access to broadband, and so by helping people get connected to low cost broadband at home. They're helping themselves connect their services to their customers. So I'm sorry I'll stop there. No, that, thank you. That's exactly I always feel like sometimes we know a lot about what's going on behind the scenes. But our working group doesn't always know all the things that we've been discussing. So I really appreciate you fully putting that in context. and I see several other committee members shaking their head as well. Thank you very much. Alright, we are. Going to go ahead and go to the next agenda item. So, Mr. Adams, we're going to go ahead and discuss the digital equity public comment process. Yes,

absolutely. If we go to the next slide we would hope that that we heard everybody but acknowledge that we might not have and we also want to make sure that we heard people right? So as part of the digital equity plan, public comment process, which again, as we notice up top because of the no-cost extension that we received from the NTIA. It's going to be a 45 day public comment process. Wanted to kind of map out for folks the way that this would work. It's you know, because I know people are used to providing public comment to different agencies. So when the plan is done, we will post the plan on the Broadband for All portal. the public. We've created a form where members of the public partners, stakeholders can comment on specific sections of the digital equity plan. We will receive that, we will instantaneously, or, you know, have a response. You will be acknowledged that we've received your comments. We will consider comments and revise the plan as appropriate. And then we will catalog all of the public comment we've received identify where it's been integrated into the plan and include that in the final draft plan. That we will post before you know. We submit it to the NTIA and the next slide again. I've mentioned. you know folks have been very flexible with us, and we've been very flexible with an evolving process. So what we wanted to do is give you an involved timeline containing some of the new. You know, milestones that we've discussed in the course of this meeting. And so you'll see the public comment period will. you know. begin sometime in the coming weeks, and we'll into through the fourth quarter of this year. We will integrate public comment essentially in real time. But are allowing a buffer, because we're not sure when those are all going to come in, the NTIA will have a curing process that is required, and then you know what they'll review. Our plan will consider their final comments. We will publish the final digital equity plan sometime in the first quarter of next year, and then the capacity grant notice of funding opportunity which will really give the state to fund and implement. The plan will come out, and the first or late, first or second quarter of next year, and then the competitive grants. And so that's a general timeline updated timeline that we can give you. And I believe that commences my presentation. Thank you, Mr. Adams. I'm going to go ahead and open it up to any committee members or work. Sorry working group members. If you have any questions regarding the timeline alright, see none in the room and none online. So that actually transitions us to the very last part, which is making sure that I'm doing this correctly. But we're at basically going to get a beat update from Mr. Osborn. Thank you, Chair. So this, if you want to move to the next slide. This is actually Commissioner. How has already addressed the slide? I just wanted to make 3 additional points regarding the BEAD timeline. So as Commissioner Houck said earlier, the plan is to submit the initial proposal. At the end of December. Cv. Staff will begin engagement and educational outreach in the first quarter of next year to help stakeholders understand the challenge process as it's approved by the NTIA staff will also hold similar engagements in advance of the opening of the grant window, so the grant window will open after the challenge process ends. To help stakeholders understand the process of applying for a grant and finally, staff will notify interested parties and stakeholders of how to participate in these

opportunities in advance and we'll confirm the schedule for the new year. Thank you. Clear and concise. Thank you, Mr. Osborn. Are there any additional comments or questions of Mr. Osborn regarding the BEAD program? Alright, seeing none in the room. Not online. All right. That gets us to the very last. In closing. We are going to give an opportunity for the public to answer, basically, it's a Q&A. So, Ms. Nguyen if you'd basically walk us through the guidelines. Course. Thank you. We will now open. Q&A to all attendees. Please use your raise hand feature on Zoom or star 9 if you are calling in by phone. Please limit your comments or questions to 2 min per entity per one to ensure others have a chance to participate. Laura will announce your answers in the order of hands raise on Zoom, and then verbalize incoming questions from the Q&A. Chat. yeah. thank you. Everyone. We are going to start with those of you who have your hands raised in Zoom first. Sorry. We're going to start with those of you who have your hands raised in Zoom first. So we will go ahead and start with. By the way, pardon me if I mispronounce any names. Please. Please correct me. Wally Siembab. Yes, Hi, too badly my last name is not Elliot. That would be easy to pronounce. Huh? Anyway. Yes, governments, and I impressive data collection effort surveys online and phone calls and all that is just terrific. I would very much like to work with them. I'm the research director for the organization, but I need them on my desktop. So I've seen some of these presentations before they go by pretty quick. When can I get access to all of the data and the tables, and so forth, so that I can get them on my desktop so I can work with them. It will lead Scott. Sorry for the informality, but I know where we've seen each other so many of the workshops. I'm just going to call you by your first name. Hi, Sunne, so we are. Like is on the on the data side. We've confirmed that we are going to share the data with folks we're looking at and the timeline accordingly. Is that we're going to finish the digital equity plan. First we're going to post that we will post some complimentary high level analysis of the data and all of the surveys on the Broadband for All portal which will be available on or about the time we post public comment. We are working through cause there's enormous mountains of data on all of those. how to, you know. to presented data in in a format that is useful to folks, and it's going to take us some time to think a little bit more about how we do that! But looking towards the somewhere around the first quarter of next year, when we think we might come up with the solution, we would definitely love to get your thoughts and feedback from folks on what kinds of information and what formats that information that we can share with you because you all helped generate the data. And we want to make sure that it's available. Scott, the reason I'm asking is that we're doing our own digital equity plan. It'll be obviously small scale compared to what you're working on. But I would very much like to find to be able to compare the data we're collecting through focus groups and online surveys and so forth, with what the statewide averages and the same categories. And we're working with low income and racial diverse community. So that's why I'm asking. So it obviously sooner than better, would be great. I understand the amount of data you're dealing with, and how hard it would be that to put in shape. But anyway, as soon as we can get it, that would be useful. got it.

And while the I'm going to ask staff to put my email in the chat, or I think you have my information feel free to reach out and talk to us a little more about whatever the specific needs are. Yup. Thank you, Ollie, and thank you. Deputy Director Adams. Alex Elliot, you are up. Thank you. Can you hear me? Okay, yes, we can. I just want to thank everybody for just a massive amount of work, and it was really promising to see some of the results from the digital equity survey and those data points, and just thankful for being a part of it as a subject matter, expert on serving with people with disabilities. I just have one comment just in one of the graphs as a benchmark for identifying the number of people with disabilities in California. You use the five-year ACS, and it said 11. I just would be kind of cautious around that number that seems just low. So I'm hoping perhaps we could use another benchmark as a data point. I know, for other populations on that graph. You use the different benchmark than the ACS 5 year average, because like the CDC has, you know, adults over 18 around one and 4 when the federal government just identified people with disabilities as a health disparity population, they had it around one. So in the data it seems like you guys over sampled. But if we used a different benchmark, it would seem we're more it's more representative. So that's just one comment I had but really appreciate all the work. And just deleting some of the digital divide. Thank you. Thank you, Alex, and we've really appreciated all of your wonderful input and subject matter expertise on the working groups. We'll take another look at that data and take a look at the benchmark relative to our findings. And I'm also glad that you highlighted that because something that we tried significantly to do both on the phone survey. We'll work with the Department of Rehabilitation, and Jacob Johnson, who's one of the members of this group? To for the first time, we think, ever to over sample? You know. the disabled population in California on the phone survey. And equally so on the online survey. So our goal is to be inclusive to, but also to get it right. So we'll be following up with you on your suggestion about benchmarks. Thank you. Arlene Krebs. Thank you. For many of us. Deeply and long term involved in these efforts. We've been able to seek out other sources of funding besides the public funding from the state many local community foundations and giving funding agencies support our digital equity and access work. And so, therefore. some of the slides in particular, Sunny's slides from CETF. Those would be extremely helpful in grant writing narratives and examples of how we, our work has been began in the 2,000 began in 2,008, and continues in 2,023 and 24, to show that those changes in our state and in our regions. So my question is, can we get just the slides to be able to use those now? Because the next big round of grant writing in private giving starts in November, December, January, for consideration in 2024 March through June giving programs. So is it possible to get those slides as a separate download even as a pdf file would help be helpful. Thank you very much. Not. I know you're on mute. But these are public available to the public, and we would be able to make them available. Scott, do you want to provide some details? Yeah, absolutely. I was just going to say that these slides as soon as they're remediated, will be posted on the Broadband for All portal, and we will send notification to all of the attendees of the meeting here that those are up and Miss

Krebs. I also want to direct you to the to the Broadband for All portal is any of the information that we've gathered throughout the planning process, the videos, the presentations data on those presentations and then strategies, summaries from the working groups. Those are all available for yours and other organizations use for grant writing purposes. And you can always reach out to our staff if you have any questions on you know how to access that information. Thank you. You're welcome. And additionally we will put the link to the past events page in the chat, so that when this becomes available you'll also be able to access it there. Josh Butler. Yes, thank you, Josh Butler, with Human IT. As people become connected here through the BEAD funding I'm curious to know what percentage of that funding do you think will be available for digital literacy? I was in a meeting yesterday in Delaware, and the answer to that question was 0. I'm wondering what that answer in California might be. Thank you. Mr. Osborn. Yes, thank you for your question. This is Rob Osborn from the CPUC. Given our estimate of the broadband. Need I would say our C. Our answer is similar to Delaware's where BEAD funding will be directed first and foremost under the NOFO. Has to be directed toward last mile. I don't expect that there will be money out outside of last mile projects to fund other activities that are highlighted in the NOFO. But that's sort of my preliminary assessment at this point. Can I also ask Mr. Adams? I know we are looking at as a part of the digital equity plan. There might be opportunities for additional grant dollars. I know you are off over the Office of Broadband and Digital Literacy. So that is something that's very passionate. As he was talking about digital literacy. Is there anything you want to say about the question? Well, I yes, and I think it explains earlier on people. We're seeing some repetition on digital equity and BEAD. And that's intentional. Is that the investment infrastructure and jobs act broadband programs or part of the Federal Internet for All program. That's we're leveraging for Broadband for all here in California. BEAD is the major the major pool of funding. It's like a 42 billion dollar fund. California got about 1.8 7 billion. But the Digital Equity Act, the it has about 2.7 5 billion dollars worth of funds. And so the state is going to receive an allocation of digital equity capacity grant dollars that are separate of BEAD. We aren't quite aware of what that allocation amount will be, but it will be Calvin California's relatively fair share of 1.44 billion dollars. Those funds will be used to implement the digital equity plan and really are designed to work hand in hand with the existing programs that CPUC is already doing. And that's part of why coordination between our 2 entities throughout the process. And you know, before and thereafter is so important. And I'm looking at Commissioner Houck cause I know she's looking at me, that I should also mention that the CPUC has existing programs in place, that address digital equity. So we have through the California Advent Services Fund. the adoption account. We have the public housing account and through those programs we funded a large number of digital equity activities to connections, to teach them digital navigation skills, and then also free Wi-fi and public housing. So those programs have been in place and those programs continue to accept applications from CBO's. Thank you, Rob, for making that comment. And then I'm going to apologize that I have another commitment at 3 o'clock. But Director

Osborn will be here, and he'll be able to answer questions, and I will check with him after the meeting to get an update on any of the comments. If that's okay Chair.. That is absolutely okay. Thank you, Commissioner. Houck for your participation. Thank you. Everyone. Hi, Teresa! Teresa! Here San Diego Futures Foundation. I have a question for you. We participate. We're in partnership with the city of San Diego. We go into the libraries and we provide digital literacy services to our customers. What we're finding is they're more in need at times where the help desk technicians. So I'm curious to know if your digital equity plans includes on-site help desk technicians or the right to repair. Hi, Theresa! It's good to see you again. Hey? How's it going? Good. Good. So part of here in California we had Assembly Bill 2750, which went a little further than other states did, and where the Legislature designated, you know, which department was going to develop the digital equity plan and part of what they had asked us to do through that legislation was to survey the digital navigation services that we're going on throughout the state of California. We, you know, through the digital equipment ecosystem mapping tool we've and the surveys we've identified. There's a host of needs that are They could be addressed by digital navigation. And there's a need to kind of call out, what digital navigation is it broadband adoption? Is it digital literacy training? Is it ongoing technical support? Is it remote or online? And so we've tried to keep the approach and the draft digital equity plan broad about developing just the a grant program that would have the flexibility to provide grants to a number of folks. But really those are the kind of things that we'd be looking for you all to provide public comment on, and the draft plan and help us hone and refine the final draft based on you know what you all feel. The need will be for the State to best empower your organizations and your community. Thank you, Deputy Director Adams. Thank you. Teresa. I'm going to move on to the questions that came on in through Q&A. But we will come back around just in case somebody else does want to raise their hand and ask another question. So, moving over to Deputy Director Adams, this one's going to be for you. Under. It's a question is under connected phone only, and is there a breakdown on what connected looks like? Also, is there a way to look at these numbers regionally, and this is when Sunne was talking about the phone surveys the other end. Sorry. Turn myself off. Yes, and I think the easiest way that I would answer, that is that we go into that in the draft digital equity plan, and we'll post the summary analysis the high level summary analysis of the phone survey and include the methodology on that. And the definitions do the same for the online survey. You know honor about when we post the digital equity plan. So you'll have all of that information and we'll like you said. We'll give it out and increasingly larger bits as we get the capacity to make it more useful to folks. So I do want to acknowledge we do have a another question Deputy Director Adams did answer it, which is, when will the findings of the phone survey be posted on the Broadband for All website? And that is as soon as we do release the digital equity plan. going to go back and double check, or just the clarification. So when we release the digital equity plan, there will be a high level summary and analysis of the surveys. But if want to be sure that we're being clear in the expectations of the community that there has been

and expressed desire for folks to get, you know, larger, you know. data at regional levels. And for that it's going to take some time. And we don't envision. We're going to be sharing that level of information until after the public comment period, at least until the first quarter of next year. Thank you. We have a additional question that came in. How soon will the recording of this meeting be available? It will be made available on the Broadband for All website. Once it is remediated, and then it will be posted in the past events. Paige having in mind the incarcerated individuals, will there be an option to submit comments on the plan in writing, or those gathered, or are those gathered online? Only we will accommodate comments. However, it's, you know. most easily done for folks given where they are and what their constraints are. We created the online form to help us. Given how extensive the engagement is we have to manage our staff and our flow to accommodate those. So I think. You know. Obviously, we welcome public comment in any format we would prefer online. And for incarcerated folks, we were constrained by the because this is a federal grant. There was a human subject research constraints that did not allow us to survey incarcerated folks. I mean, we've worked with a lot of great nonprofits to hear from the justice involved community and advocates for justice involved community. And we would really like to hear from justice involved individuals. So our office is happy to the work with you all, to figure out a way to receive comments that may come from that particular group. Thank you. I'm going to pause for just a moment to make sure that there isn't anyone else who wants to raise your hand. I did check. We don't have any callers today. So just give a moment in case anyone wants to ask one more question. All right. Thank you all for your questions and your comments, Madam Chair, I'm going to turn it back over to you. Thank you, Laura. and I also want to thank everyone that participated over the last several sessions of the Statewide Digital Equity Planning work group. This has been a very informative process. We just concluded. Our fourth today is our fourth just from a timing perspective pending the public comment on the digital equity plan, the group will be reinstated. In order to make sure that we are, you know, getting and incorporating those comments accurately. So we don't have an exact date when we're reconvening. But we will be posting that through our newsletter and reaching out to the distribution list and the advocacy groups that we have been in contact with. So again. I just want to thank everyone for a wonderful 2023. We have a lot to celebrate but we all also have to get prepared to roll up our sleeves and be ready to actually put this plan into action into 2024. So thank you very much for everyone, both at the state level and the community level for your engagement and your participation. And we hope that you're as proud of the plan as we are once it is, is finalized. So thank you, and have a wonderful day.